Peer Mediation Programs: Teaching Students Alternatives to Violence

Brian Koy Harper

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarship.law.missouri.edu/jdr

Part of the Dispute Resolution and Arbitration Commons

Recommended Citation

Available at: https://scholarship.law.missouri.edu/jdr/vol1993/iss2/4

This Comment is brought to you for free and open access by the Law Journals at University of Missouri School of Law Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Journal of Dispute Resolution by an authorized editor of University of Missouri School of Law Scholarship Repository.
PEER MEDIATION PROGRAMS: 
TEACHING STUDENTS 
ALTERNATIVES TO VIOLENCE

I. INTRODUCTION

With the ever-rising occurrence of violence\(^1\) within schools\(^2\) and the high level of both student apathy and dropout rates, many people are wondering what, if anything, can be done to stem the tidal wave that seems about to crash our nation's schools upon the rocks of failure. Increasing security measures in schools, such as metal detectors,\(^3\) armed police guards, and locker searches, may prevent the violence,\(^4\) but will probably not alleviate the underlying causes.\(^5\)

---


3. Ron Stephens, spokesman for the National School Safety Center, feels that metal detectors and other increased security measures are a "quick fix" used by school systems to alleviate parental and political pressure. Christine Hawes, *Metal Detectors in School Set Off Alarms*, CHL TRIB. (North Edition), Nov. 27, 1992, § 3, at 1. According to Stephens, "[y]ou can look at the hardware all you want, but the most critical element in stopping classroom violence is the software: the people." Id.

4. Many teachers argue that the additional security measures may prevent the occurrence of violence at present, but will not, in the long run, reduce the overall level of violence. Robert D. McFadden, *In Debate Over Security in Schools, System's Diversity Keeps Solutions Elusive*, N.Y. TIMES, Mar. 2, 1992, at B3. More attention must be paid to the reasons why the violence occurred. Id. According to Ed Muir, public safety director for the United Federation of Teachers Union, "[m]ore guards and more metal detectors is an answer, but not the answer. The system has got to get very heavily involved from the early grades on up [stressing values in education] . . . . We need crisis management, peer mediation, [and] counseling to solve interpersonal disputes." Id.

5. Many administrators feel that these measures may not be enough. *McCall on Violence in the School*, N.Y. TIMES, Sept. 27, 1992, § 1, at 35. H. Carl McCall, school board president at South Shore High School in Brooklyn, believes that "we've got to go beyond that [metal detectors] and begin to go into some of the root causes of the violence and the root causes of the lack of security in schools." Id. Along these same lines, Ron Stephens of the National School Safety Center believes that metal detectors are poor substitutes for dealing with the real reasons behind violence in the schools. See Hawes, *supra* note 3, at 1.
Often cited as one of the principle causes is the belief held by students\(^6\) that they are neither valued nor respected by society at large.\(^7\)

In an attempt to address this and other underlying causes, many schools,\(^8\) especially those located in large urban areas such as New York City, Los Angeles, and St. Louis,\(^9\) have joined the recent trend toward the use of mediation as a way to handle problems arising between conflicting parties.\(^10\) This may be done through the implementation of a Peer Mediation Program\(^11\) within the school.\(^12\)

---

6. According to sixth-grader Kristin Camasta of the Grayslake Middle School near Chicago, "it's easy for kids to think that no one will care and that no one will help them." Steve Toloken, Students Learn to Solve Problems Their Way, CHI. TRIB. (Lake Edition), Oct. 28, 1992, § 2, at 3.

7. McCall on Violence in the School, supra note 5, at 35. This alienation from society is directly addressed by adding more peer mediation programs, guidance counselors, and social workers. Id.

8. There are approximately two thousand peer mediation programs in existence nationally according to the National Association for Mediation in Education. Lisa Leff, Schools Using Peers to Press for Amity; Trend Toward Mediation Teams Cuts Across Grade Levels in Effort to Curb Violence, WASH. POST, Apr. 19, 1992, at B1.


10. Mediation is now being used in a wide variety of situations to try to solve the underlying problems and lower the costs of the conflict resolution process. Mediation is used in fields as diverse as divorce proceedings (see Steven T. Knuppel, Comment, Problems and Practice in Divorce Mediation, 1991 J. DISP. RESOL. 127, 127-35), and hate crimes (the University of Texas-Austin sponsors a program involving mediation between the victim and the perpetrator of reported cases. The program has met with a high degree of success). See Matt Helms, License to Hate, U.: NAT'L COLLEGE MAG., Aug.-Sept. 1992, at 14.

11. There are several common reasons given for the implementation of a peer mediation program within schools. The following are the ten most common:

1. To approach the conflict in the schools with training and not with avoidance;
2. To institute a better way of dealing with conflict in schools than the current system using expulsion, detention, etc.;
3. To improve communication between all parties involved;
4. To reduce violence, vandalism, suspension, and school absence;
5. To instill lifetime dispute resolution skills for students and faculty;
6. To increase student interest in the legal system, conflict resolution, justice, and citizenship activity;
7. To shift the problem solving responsibility to students and thereby allow teachers to concentrate on educating students instead of disciplining them;
8. To improve the basic skills of listening, critical thinking, and problem solving, which are basic to all learning;
9. To prepare students to live in a multi-cultural world by emphasizing listening to other points of view;
10. To address problems which are unique to young people and are difficult for students to take to adults.


The purpose of peer mediation programs is to keep the small, everyday problems that teenagers face from escalating to violence. Such programs lessen the burden upon the legal system by keeping students' conflicts from reaching the level of criminal behavior, which would require the attention of the already overburdened criminal justice system.

II. PEER MEDIATION PROGRAMS

The first major item of importance when establishing a peer mediation program is to obtain a commitment of support from the administration and faculty of the targeted school. Without the full cooperation of the administration, regarding both financial support and organizational assistance with the daily operations of the program, a peer mediation program will not succeed. In addition, faculty support is crucial; it is often the faculty who will actually be introducing and explaining the program to the students. Also, teachers are

13. Introducing peer mediation programs in the schools has shown students that their problems can be worked out without resorting to physical violence. Don't Cut Off Funds for Mediation, N.Y. Times, Oct. 28, 1990, § 12, at 19. School systems have found that this has lead to a reduction in problems with truancy, fighting, and racial confrontations within the school. Id.

14. By making mediation available to the students on a daily basis, schools with peer mediation programs hope to make alternative problem solving methods a habit with students. Seth Agulnick, Talking Out Problems, NEWSDAY (New York), Mar. 12, 1992, Closeup Section, at 27. School officials involved in the peer mediation programs hope that this habit will replace students' tendency of always resorting to violence first. Id. According to Peter Ward, associate director of Community Mediation Services in New York City, "[t]he idea is to make mediation an integral part of the school's program. It can prevent a lot of conflicts from escalating." Id.

15. This is one of the purposes of nearly all mediation programs, but is particularly compelling when concerned with teenagers. Don't Cut Off Funds for Mediation, supra note 13, at 19.


17. Richard Cohen, of School Mediation Associates in Cambridge, Massachusetts, strongly believes in the effectiveness of peer mediation programs, but stresses the importance of the support of the administration in schools seeking to implement a peer mediation program. Wendy Fox and Diane Manuel, After Student Stabbing, Many Wonder How System Can Help Youngsters Avoid a Similar Fate; Death in Boston High: Can Schools Curb Violence?, BOSTON GLOBE, Dec. 16, 1990, at A20. Cohen feels that "without a real commitment on the part of the administration, [support for the peer mediation program] just doesn't last." Id.

18. Id.

19. Under the approach used by The Prevention Resource Center of Columbia, Missouri, teachers are involved in a role playing exercise to introduce the peer mediation programs at a school assembly (see PREVENTION RESOURCE CENTER, FAMILY COUNSELING CENTER OF MISSOURI, INC., CONFLICT MEDIATION, Secondary Section, at 10 (1992)) or to students in their homerooms. Id., Administration Section, at 3.
often asked to recommend students\textsuperscript{20} to be considered for selection as peer mediators in the mediation programs.\textsuperscript{21} In order to obtain the teachers' support, it is necessary to convince them that a peer mediation program will be beneficial to the school system.\textsuperscript{22}

The majority of peer mediation programs have several basic operational rules. The programs usually require the disputants to agree to mediation; to agree that they will not fight during the process; to agree that no put-downs or name-calling will occur; to agree that only one person will speak at a time; to agree that all participants will be honest; and to agree that the confidentiality\textsuperscript{23} of all conversations during the program will be respected.\textsuperscript{24} These guiding principles of the peer mediation programs are meant to ensure impartiality and fairness to all parties involved and to achieve a "win-win" situation that will benefit both parties in some fashion.\textsuperscript{25} By achieving a result mutually acceptable to each party, the mediation programs show students that there does not need to be a losing party in every case.\textsuperscript{26}

The programs also try to develop an alternative to violence and physical conflict within the schools as a method to resolve students' problems.\textsuperscript{27} Many people hope that by promoting peer mediation programs, students will carry these alternative approaches with them\textsuperscript{28} into their adult lives.\textsuperscript{29} Supporters of peer

\textsuperscript{20} It is recommended that the students selected as peer mediators mirror the overall school population as much as is possible. \textsc{Prevention Resource Ctr.}, \textit{supra} note 19, Administration Section, at 15.
\textsuperscript{21} \textit{Id.} at 19.
\textsuperscript{22} Linda Jacobson, \textit{School Program Teaches Real-Life Savvy in Conflict Resolution; Student Mediators Help Settle Disputes}, \textsc{Atlanta J. and Const.}, Jan. 29, 1993, at J1. According to Alexis Kirijan, a counselor who recently initiated a peer mediation program in a school in Atlanta, the problem is that "[t]eachers are used to handling things their own way. At first they were skeptical of letting go." \textit{Id.}
\textsuperscript{23} For an analysis of the confidentiality requirement and how it applies to mediation proceedings, see John R. Murphy III, \textit{In the Wake of Tarasoff: Mediation and the Duty to Disclose}, 35 \textsc{Cath. U. L. Rev.} 209, 209-12, 236 (1985).
\textsuperscript{24} \textsc{Prevention Resource Ctr.}, \textit{supra} note 19, Secondary Section: Student Manual, at 5.
\textsuperscript{25} \textit{Id.} note 19, Administration Section, at 1. "[B]oth parties in Win-Win reap the benefits of the disagreement as well as a satisfactory conclusion." \textit{Id.}
\textsuperscript{26} "When mediation steps are followed both parties can end their meeting with acceptance and open paths of communication." \textit{Id.}
\textsuperscript{27} "The program is designed to get children into the language of talking their problems out as opposed to fighting it out" and to encourage students to think first of peaceful solutions to their problems. Agulinick, \textit{supra} note 14, at 27.
\textsuperscript{28} Mediation generally enhances the abilities needed to deal with conflict and endows the participants with skills which can be applied to various other situations in the future. \textit{See generally} Harrington and Merry, \textit{Ideological Production: The Making of Community Mediation}, 22 \textsc{Law & Soc'y Rev.} 709, 715 (1988).
\textsuperscript{29} Student mediators have found that their use of mediation skills learned in peer mediation programs goes far beyond the classroom. Edna Negron, \textit{Making Peace; Children Learn to Mediate Arguments}, \textsc{Newsday} (New York), Mar. 10, 1991, News Section, at 1. Chrystal Massie, a peer mediator at the Brooklyn New School, feels that mediation has helped her become more responsible.
mediation programs stress that by undergoing the training and using conflict mediation on a daily basis, students create an atmosphere of cooperation that will extend beyond the problems being mediated and into their daily lives.\textsuperscript{30} This would benefit their future employers, as well as society in general.\textsuperscript{31} Ideally, students who have gone through a peer mediation program will be better prepared to deal with the daily problems that arise and to solve them in a manner that benefits everyone, without resorting to physical violence of any sort.\textsuperscript{32}

The following is a list of steps to be followed when establishing a peer mediation program within a school:

* Investigate mediation program for school;
* Present proposal to school board for approval;
* Orientate staff as to nature of proposed program;
* Inform parents of proposed mediation program;
* Present proposed program to student body;
* Select peer mediators;
* Train peer mediators and program coordinator;
* Conduct practice sessions with student body;
* Conduct follow-up training;
* Implement full-scale peer mediation program;
* Evaluate program; and
* Expand program into other schools in community.\textsuperscript{33}

\begin{flushright}
for her actions. \textit{Id.}
\end{flushright}

\begin{flushleft}

31. The Board of Cooperative Educational Services II in New York City has found that the training the students receive concerning how to handle "interpersonal conflicts" in the classroom carries over into the workplace, as well as into familial settings. Jayme Wolfson, \textit{Schools Get Good Grades in Report}, \textit{NEWSDAY} (New York), Nov. 15, 1989, News Section, at 34.

32. According to Jefferson School Superintendent Dr. Don Rooks, whose school system is in Jefferson, Georgia, "[w]hen the kids go through mediation, I hope the next time conflict arises they will look at the fact that there is another way to resolve it. You don't have to resort to fight or flight." Burson, \textit{supra} note 11, at B1. Mediation programs also create an atmosphere of cooperation which is carried over into other areas of the students' lives. \textit{Id.}

33. \textit{PREVENTION RESOURCE CTR.}, \textit{supra} note 19, Administration Section, at 3.

Published by University of Missouri School of Law Scholarship Repository, 1993
III. RESULTS OF PEER MEDIATION PROGRAMS

As with any program, peer mediation is not the answer to every problem that arises within a school system.\(^34\) There are both successes\(^35\) and failures.\(^36\) The failures often occur because certain students are not willing to attempt mediation\(^37\) when faced with a potential conflict.\(^38\) Instead, these students choose to continue to fight.\(^39\) Overall, however, schools that have implemented peer mediation programs have seen positive results.

Perhaps the most important positive result is a decrease in violence in the classroom. In a recent survey of 200 New York teachers and administrators who have used peer mediation programs, an astounding seventy-one percent reported a decrease in classroom violence after the implementation of a peer mediation program.\(^40\) There was also a marked decrease in verbal abuse.\(^41\) In Washington, D.C., similar results have been reported, with the number of fights being cut in half after peer mediation programs were introduced into the school system.\(^42\) Furthermore, in schools where peer mediation programs are in place, a decrease in the general level of criminal activity has been reported.\(^43\)

\(^{34}\) School officials readily admit that the mediation programs will not eliminate all problems. Leff, supra note 8, at B1. Their hope is that the students will try to deal with their problems when they are at the "trivial" stage. Id.

\(^{35}\) "The most obvious - and often overlooked - benefit is that most cases are resolved effectively," according to Richard Cohen, director of School Mediation Associates in Maryland. See Burson, supra note 11, at B1. In the words of Christine Olivieri, a peer mediator at PS 230 in New York City, "[m]ediation works because the kids most of the time don't come back." See Negron, supra note 29, News Section, at 1.

\(^{36}\) The students involved in the peer mediation programs admit that their offers of help are not always accepted. They are sometimes seen as "nosy or pushy or odd." James Walsh, At Burnsville Schools, Young Voices of Reason Help Troubled Students, ST. PAUL STAR TRIB., Jan. 19, 1992, at A1.

\(^{37}\) Frank Stetson, principal of Duval High School in Washington, D.C., states that, "[u]nfortunately, the students who are most likely to resort to force probably will be the most resistant to finding peaceful alternatives to violence." Leff, supra note 8, at B1. In an attempt to alter this situation, students with a history of behavior problems are recruited to be peer mediators at some schools. Id.

\(^{38}\) "You can't force a kid to sit down and talk, but you can give him the option," is the optimistic summation of the peer mediation program's limitations according to Peter Ward, an associate executive director of Community Mediation Services in New York City. Agulnick, supra note 14, Closeup Section, at 27.

\(^{39}\) Michele Miller, Program Helps Pupils Work it Out On Own, ST. PETERSBURG TIMES, Dec. 30, 1992, Pasco Times Section, at 3. According to mediator Joe Burger, "[s]ome kids don't want to resolve their problems. They just want to keep fighting." Id.

\(^{40}\) Edna Negron, Resolving Conflict is a Lesson For Everyone, NEWSDAY (New York), Sept. 27, 1992, News Section, at 8.

\(^{41}\) Id.

\(^{42}\) Leff, supra note 8, at B1.

\(^{43}\) In a recent survey, the New York Board of Education found that reports of assaults, robberies, sex offenses, and drug and weapon possession were significantly lower for the 1990-91 school year. McFadden, supra note 4, at B3. Peer mediation programs were seen as a factor...
Suspension rates have also gone down in schools using peer mediation programs. As a result of the decrease in violence and criminal activity, students report an increase in their sense of security at school. In addition, students' levels of self-esteem increase as they learn to resolve their own problems and work out solutions on their own. These changes combine to create a positive change in the students' attitudes. These changes in attitude are also reflected in the faculty of the schools. Teachers working in schools with peer mediation programs found that they had gained a new and better understanding of their students and were better able to listen to their concerns.

In addition, participants are generally more satisfied with the results reached via mediation than those that would have occurred if litigation had been used. A major factor in this satisfaction is the fact that in mediation, parties generally feel they are treated fairly and equally.

IV. FUNDING THE PROGRAM

Perhaps the most difficult task in establishing a peer mediation program is locating the necessary funds for training and resources. Due to the financial "crunch" currently effecting many school systems, budgets are increasingly threatened. Generally, the first areas to lose funding are those not directly contributing to the decline. Id.

44. Surrattsville High School, located in Prince George's County, reports that after the implementation of peer mediation programs within the school system, the suspension rate dropped from 19.2% to 11.9%. Laura M. Litvan, "Let's Talk" Policy Curbs Fighting at PG School, WASH. TIMES, Feb. 2, 1992, at A8.

45. There is generally an increase in students' self-esteem and a decrease in disciplinary problems which combine to create a climate within the school where students feel safe. Burson, supra note 11, at B1.

46. Miller, supra note 39, Pasco Times Section, at 3.

47. An evaluation of the peer mediation programs in the New York School systems for the 1988-89 school year showed impressive figures. Eighty-four percent of the teachers surveyed said they had seen positive changes within their classes. Negron, supra note 29, News Section, at 1.

48. More than 92% of the teachers in an evaluation of peer mediation programs in New York City noticed a positive change in their own attitudes about conflict. Id.

49. Id.

50. McMasters, supra note 12, at 763, 767 n.170.

51. Id. at 766-67.

52. When asked why peer mediation programs are not in place within all schools, H. Carl McCall, School Board President of South Shore High School (located in New York), responded "it's mostly lack of money." McCall on Violence in the School, supra note 5, § 1, at 35. Despite the scarce resources available, Mr. McCall stated that a "good portion" of the funding given to the New York school systems the previous year was going towards hiring and training people in peer mediation. Id.

53. Despite the possibility of financial cuts in the future fiscal year, many educators feel that the peer mediation programs must be saved. Negron, supra note 29, News Section, at 1.
related to basic educational skills. Unfortunately, peer mediation programs fall into this category.

Peer mediation programs have, at times, survived these budget cuts by demonstrating their effectiveness in decreasing violence within the schools. In New York City, the mayor decided not to cut the funds slated for peer mediation programs in the city’s school system budget since he felt that the peer mediation programs had proven effective in maintaining order in New York during the Los Angeles riots. Based on the program’s success in lowering school violence, many school administrators share this commitment to peer mediation programs and feel that they must be saved from "fall[ing] under the budgetary ax." For that reason, even if funding from the school system is cut, many administrators feel that they would seek private funding to continue the school’s peer mediation programs.

The fact that a school system cannot allocate the resources necessary to fund a peer mediation program is not an adequate reason for supporters of such a program to give up hope. Public funds, private foundations, and/or other civic organizations may be solicited and will often contribute to projects that are beneficial to society as a whole. In addition, the federal government may soon

54. These types of programs are often referred to as "soft services." Jon Kalish, Mediators Celebrate Peace; Young Volunteers Help Resolve Neighborhood Disputes, NEWSDAY (New York), May 26, 1992, News Section, at 23.
55. Id.
56. Id.
57. According to Charles Scott, director of one of the New York City mediation programs, "the lesson of Los Angeles is that there has to be an alternative to violence." Id.
58. Negron, supra note 29, News Section, at 1.
59. Id.
60. New York City, whose financial crisis was the subject of national headlines in the recent years, has established a fund which is designed to support and revitalize the school systems. Norman Rubin, The Community of Helping Hands, NEWSDAY (New York), Sept. 30, 1991, News Section, at 22. The administrators of the Fund for New York City Public Education have as their top priorities comprehensive school restructuring, professional development for teachers and school personnel, and school/community collaboration. Id. One of the programs supported by the fund is a peer mediation hot-line operating in 33 area middle schools. Id. The fund is providing much needed support for the city’s schools at a time when public resources are being cut. Id.
61. The Sun Microsystems Foundation, Inc. is a non-profit charitable organization that awards grants to programs that support and encourage education and leadership growth in the youth of America. Sun Microsystems Foundation Makes New Community Grants, BUSINESS WIRE, Mar. 23, 1992, available in LEXIS, Nexis Library, Business Wire File. Approximately $12,000 was given to support two peer mediation programs in juvenile facilities in the San Francisco Bay area. Id. Although the Sun Microsystems Foundation concentrates most of its grants in San Francisco and Boston, the location of its two major facilities, the grants are not restricted to these areas. Id.
62. In Massachusetts, the Supreme Judicial Court established the Interest on Lawyer’s Trust Accounts (IOLTA) program in 1985. IOLTA Grant Awards, MASS. LAW. WEEKLY, Oct. 7, 1991, Special Section, at 15. It provides financial support to programs which assist the poor in obtaining legal assistance and which improve the administration of justice. Id. As part of the latter function, IOLTA provided funds to two programs seeking to establish peer mediation programs in the schools of the Boston and Brighton/Allston areas. Id.
be able to provide the needed financial assistance through a new grant program. By providing funding of this type, the federal government hopes to upgrade the American educational system's standards by improving the environment of the nation's schools.

The general public can help out in their communities as well. This can be done through the donation of time and energy in establishing and developing peer mediation programs within local school districts. Such public assistance will help the community and improve the quality of the school systems. Assisting in a peer mediation program is also an alternative to normal pro bono activities engaged in by a majority of attorneys.

V. CONCLUSION

Although peer mediation does not solve all the problems facing the American educational system, it has helped to lessen a major concern of educators today: violence in the schools. Even though establishing such a program takes time, money, and a commitment from all parties involved, the benefits reaped from the program far outweigh its burdens. A peer mediation program of some sort should be implemented in every school.

BRIAN KOY HARPER

63. President Clinton is asking Congress to approve a grant program of more than $175 million to be used to assist schools in providing for long-term plans to lessen classroom violence. Gun-Control Plan Proposed for Schools, KAN. CITY STAR, June 12, 1993, at A9. One of the suggested methods for reducing the violence is the instigation of peer mediation programs. Id.

64. Id. Secretary of Education Richard W. Riley stated: "All our efforts to raise the standard of American education will be to no avail unless we provide children with a safe and disciplined environment." Id.

65. See supra notes 40-44 and accompanying text.

66. The Labor and Employment Law Section of the New York Bar Association has assisted in the formation of programs that involve attorneys as mentors to school children and establish peer mediation programs within the school. Michael I. Bernstein, Social Changes Reflected, N.Y. L.J., Jan. 27, 1993, at S4. They feel that assiting in these activities is the attorney's chance to "give back" to communities and schools. Id. Another group, the Illinois Institute for Dispute Resolution, which was formed with bar and law school sponsorship, is engaged in similar activities. Joseph Sjostrom, Even Judges Aren't Objecting to Mediation Over Litigation, CHI. TRIB., Nov. 5, 1992, DuPage Section, at 2.

67. See supra note 2.

68. See supra note 40.

69. In the words of Linda Lantieri, a coordinator of the Resolving Conflict Creatively program in New York City, "[w]e have to get rid of the notion that conflict resolution is only for the most violent schools[.] Conflict resolution is for everyone." Negron, supra note 40, News Section, at 8.